

## Foote vs Tyndall Eunice Newton Foote

In 1856, Eunice Newton Foote, a female American scientist, discovered that carbon dioxide absorbed heat more effectively than other gases. Three years later in 1859, the Irish male physicist John Tyndall arrived at the same conclusion. Though Foote was first to this insight, later known as the greenhouse effect, Tyndall received credit for the discovery. It was not until 2011, 155 years after her experiment, that Foote's work was recognized. To examine why this was the case, we must look at their work in the context of the 19<sup>th</sup> century.



Illustration of Eunice Newton Foote by Carlyn Iverson. Image courtesy of the artist.

Eunice Newton Foote (1819-1888) was a scientist, inventor, and women's rights activist. She attended an all-girls school and took some classes at a local men's science college. In 1856, Foote published her first paper *Circumstances affecting the heat of the sun's rays* in the *American Journal of Science and Arts*. In this paper she announced her discovery: different gases absorb heat differently. She put different gases in glass jars and left them in the sun as she measured their temperature. The jar with low-density air (like the air found on top of mountains) stayed cooler, while humid air (like the kind you'd find in swamps or jungles) got much hotter. Foote also found that jars with just carbon dioxide in them got much hotter. Carbon dioxide is an invisible gas emitted by cars, exhaled by humans, and expelled by volcances. In fact, Eunice discovered that carbon dioxide absorbs heat more efficiently than any other gas she tried. Because of this, she concluded, "an atmosphere of that gas would give to our earth a high temperature." Today, it is well-known that carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases are causing climate change. Carbon dioxide is called a "greenhouse gas" because of the warming effect that Eunice discovered. Just as a greenhouse traps heat inside it to keep a gardener's plants warm, carbon dioxide traps heat in the earth's atmosphere.



	On the Heat in	the Sun's Ray	x,	Marco	u's Geological	Map of the Unite	d States. 38
XXXL-0	freumstances of by EUN	fecting the Heat	of the Sun's Rays;	The high ter served. Who that provides a	nperature of has not exper	moist air has fre ienced the burnin wer? The isothe	quently been ob g heat of the su
(Read befr	re the American A	moriation Aprost	23d, 1856.)	think, be found	to be much	affected by the di	fferent degrees o
ly investigation rent circumstight that pro- everal results	ons have had ances that affe seed from the have been obt	for their object the thermal an. ained.	t to determine the action of the rays	moisture in diff Thirdly. Th be in carbonic a One of the r mon air, and th	erent places, e highest effec cid gas, eccivers was ( e result was a	t of the sun's ray filled with it, the s follows:	s I have found to other with com
liminished as	it becomes mo:	e rarified.	tey of ene an, and	In Co	noon Air.	I In Carbonie	Ariil Ges.
he experimer	its were made	with an air-put	mp and two cylin-	It shale.	In sun.	In shade,	In ens.
cal receivers	of the same s	ze, about four	inches in diame-	80 81	90	80 84	90 100
d the air was	angun. In eas	in were placed	two thermometers,	80	99	84	110
er. I had no asation or rare The observatio ows:	he condensed means at han- faction. ons taken once	tube, it attaine l of measuring in two or three	or the suns rays d only 88° in the the degree of con- e minutes, were as	very sensibly n was many times An atmosphe temperature; a tory the air hac ent, an increases	ore so than the re of that ga and if as some l mixed with l temperature	he other—and on oling. a would give to a suppose, at one it a larger propor from its own action	being removed, i our earth a hig period of its his tion than at pres on as well as from
her. I had no mastion or rare The observation llows: This circumsta fiferent places, search and the search moist than in In one of the the other is	he condensed means at han- mans taken once and Take by the second second state of the second	tube, it attaine d of measuring in two or three in two or three is state. To state. 78 80 82 85 4 the power of to produce the sun's rays was f ir was saturated	or the sum rays do only 85° in the the degree of con- or minutes, were as as Tries. Too 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 1	very sensibly m was many times An atmosph temperature; a toy the air has the a	ore so than ti as long in co ere of that ga and if as some it mixed with 1 temperature t must have n g the sun's be I gas, 104°; in carbonic ac <i>-Review of a y</i> and British Pr Kz. maps of the lated among 1	ee otherand on oling. a would give to e suppose, at one it a larger propor- from its own actic coessarily resulted in different gas in common air, l- id gas, 125°. worthon of the Geo ourince by Jula M United States pub Karopean geologie degree of attenti	being removed, i our earth a high period of its his ion than at pree m as well as from i.e. I found it & (06°; in oxyget coical Map of bl arcos, * by Witz lished in * Europ an and curiosity before the second
ther. I had no mastion or rare The observation lows:	he condensed means at han- faction. In taken once assist Tals by assist assist and contribute ofly mountain e action of the dry air. recoivers the a s dried by the	tube, it attained of measuring in two or three lease. leas	or the sum write of con- the degree of con- bin black of the sum o	very senably may time An attroophe temperature ; a brit an increase increased weigh On comparing be in hydroger ges, 105°; and Amr. XXXII- <i>United Satter</i> . Hast P. Baal GROLOHICAL and Widely erice repared by as This is more en- the the grees the the grees the processing the senatorial and the senatorial senatorial senatorial and senatorial	ore so than the as long in co ere of that gas of if as some l mixed with d temperature in gas, 104°; in carbonic ac <i>-Revises of a y</i> and British Pr KE, maps of the lated among 1 with no small secially true, y apply has on a never before a never before	ee otherand on oling. s would give to e suppose, at one it a larger proport from its own acti- coccessarily resulted to in different gas in common air, i di gas, 125°. workion of the Geo consisce by Julea M Canton of the Geo consisce by Julea M Canton of the Geo degree of attenti- then such mane u by recently been i been laid down	being removed, i our earth a hig period of its his tion than at pres as a well as from as well as from as a well as from the second second control of the second control of the control of the second control of the control of the con
the r. I had no maation or rare The observatic lows: This circumster association of the secondly. The moist than in fir one of the secondly. The moist than in fir one of the the other is we both were place to the second first second the second the second the second the second first second the second the second first second the s	he condensed means at han- faction. ms taken once and the second	tube, it attained of measuring in two or three in two or three in two or three in two or three is a two or the second sec	or the sum is raise or the sum is raise of com- the degree of com- minutes, were as as Toke. be sum is rays in in feeble action on found to be greater with nonstarre- the result was as e ato	very sensibly means that the sense of the se	tore so than it as long in co as long in co are of that gas of if as some it mixed with it emperature it must have an it must have an g the sun's being in carbonic ac <i>-Review of a y</i> and <i>Brith P5</i> EX. maps of the illated among i with no small secially true, y are a provided in the second accuracy.	se other—and on oling. s would give to e suppose, at one it a larger propor- from its own acti- cecessarily resulted in common air, j id gas, 125°. United States pub European geologie degree of attenti- kenropean geologie degree of attenti- then such mass et y recently been !	being removed, i our earth a high period of its his tion than at press and a series of the series of the last of the series of the optical Map of the arcos, * by Witt lished in-Europ and curiosity on and curiosity on and curiosity on and curiosity on a map will J. Marcos, while the series of the series of the on a map will descent the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the series of the s
the of a line of the second se	he condensed means at have means at have not taken once asset Take asset Take	tube, it attaine l of measuring in two or three in two or three in two or three in the order of the second	or the and single doubt of a set in the the degree of con- the degree of con- minutes, were as an the set Take. be anti-rays in in feeble action on ound to be greater by the nonlinerre- do realitions as as an as as as an as as an as as an as as an as as an as as a	very sensibly and the sense of	tore so than it as long in coars of that gand if as some 1 mixed with 1 temperature t must have n if the some 1 gas, 104°; in carbonic as <i>Barbish Postick Postick Coarse and Barbish Postick Postick Postick Coarse and Barbish Postick Coarse and Barbish Postick Coarse and Barbish Postick Coarse and the source of a second postic temploy has on the non- second postic as a second postic temploy and the second postic as a second postic temploy has and the second postic as a second postic temploy has and the second postic as a second postic as a second postic temploy has and the second postic as a seco</i>	ee other—and on oling. s would give to e suppose, at one it a larger propor- from its own active coessarily resulted in common air, is digas, 120°. Sortions of the Geo covince by Jolka M United States pub European geologis degree of attenti- rhen such mass e before the attenti- rhen such mass e by recently been t been laid down and profile by M. des Mines and it	being removed, i our carth a higg from the second of the last tion than at prese and the second of the second last of the second of the arcos of the second of the arcos of the WHI lished in-Europs gs, are necessarily ubrace regions of and e known and on a map will a the Bullstin of
This circumstation or rar The observation lows:	he condensed means at have not a transmission on a set Transmission on a set Transmission on a set and the set set and contribute only mountains and contribute of the set my Ak- be set.	tube, it attaine l of measuring : in two or three in two or three is a state of the state is a state of the state of the state of the state is a state of the state of the state of the state is a state of the state of the state of the state of the state is a state of the state of the state of the state of the state is a state of the state of the state of the state of the state is a state of the st	or the sum is raise of the sum is raise of com- the degree of com- minutes, were as as <u>race</u> . The sum is rays in the sum is realised as the sum is	very seenably may time An atmosphe temperature : a by the art has increased weigh On comparing by hydrogen ges, 108°; and Air, XXXII- Unied States, MAR, P. Bax Grotograch, and widely circu repared by us This is more en- which the geog be goology in an appared in "The recent ge- ta appared in the second the second second second the second second second the second second second the second second second second second second the second second second second second second the second sec	to be so than it is as long in co ere of that ga and if as some of that ga it is a some in the some of the some of the so- in carbonic ac <i>Review of a game of the barry of the barry of a game of a game of a game of the barry o</i>	se other—and on oling. s would give to e suppose, at one it a larger propose conserved proposed of the construction of the Geo- covince by Jules M United States pub Courtons of the Geo- covince by Jules M United States pub Course of attentia Been laid down and profile by M. des Mines and in des Mines and pro-	being removed, our earth a hig period of its hin ion than a pren ma swell as form of the second second of the second second of the second second of the second second is an experiment of the second second of the second second second second second second second second second second second second second second second second second second s
This circumstance of the other of the other of the other view of the other view of the other other of the other view of the other of the state of th	he condensed means at has means at has neares at has means the set of the set of the set of the set of the set of the set of the desired of the set of the set of the set of the desired of the set of the set of the set of the desired of the set of the set of the set of the desired of the set of the set of the set of the set of the desired of the set of the set of the set of the set of the desired of the set of the set of the set of the set of the desired of the set of th	tabe, it attaine l of measuring ' in two or three l constrained in the second l constrained in the second second constrained in the second l constraints and second l const	of the substrated of the substrated the degree of con- the degree of con- the degree of con- manded and the substrated of the substrated the substrated the substrated of colleans. the result was as a stated to the substrated of colleans.	very sensibly and the sense of	tore so than it as long in co are of that gan of if as some in mixed with it temperature it temperature it must have n gas, JOA <sup>6</sup> ; in carbonic ac <i>-Review of a</i> y <i>mull Brithh Pice</i> <i>CR</i> maps of the <i>blated</i> among it with no small second y that in act of the <i>invert</i> before a socially true, <i>invert</i> <i>invert</i> before <i>invert</i> before	se other-and on oling. s would give to s mprose, at one from its own settin from its own settin to own most in the own settin the own settin sertion of the Geo vorince by Julie M United States public hear such maps with the set of the Geo vorince by Julie M Childe States public works and the setting the set of the States when such maps with the set of the States when such maps with the set of the setting the setting the setting the setting the setting the setting the setting the setting the setting the set the setting the setting the setting the setting the setting the set the setting the setting the set the setting the setting the set the setting the setting the setting the setting the setting the setting the set the setting the setting the setting the setting the set the setting the setting the setting the setting the set the setting the set the setting th	being removed, our earth a hig period of its his histo taian at pre- na as well a sfror of 1 found it it def"; in oxygen boyend Mop of di- arrou * by Witz lished in-Kurop, 5; are necessaril und extraority of the strong with histo kerror an on a may with the Bulletin o the de Taniergo of the pre- to the strong strong strong strong the de Taniergo of the in p. 249. Febbase

Eunice Foote's work was published in the American Journal for Sciences and Arts.

In August 1856, at the 10<sup>th</sup> meeting of the American Association for the Advancement of Sciences' (AAAS), many scientists presented their research. Eunice Foote's husband Elisha Foote even presented his research and was elected as a member of the society. However, it was not customary for a woman to speak at these meetings. So even though there was no written rule against it, Foote did not present her own work. Instead, Joseph Henry, the Secretary for the Smithsonian Institution, read her work to the society and provided his own commentary on it. He praised her work, but he also failed to understand how significant it was.

News about Foote's work was published in a few journals in the United States, but it was not mentioned in the AAAS proceedings, the official AAAS record of the meeting. It is unlikely that these reports and her full paper were read much outside of the United States, and her work was mentioned only twice in European journals. Neither of these reports in European journals mentioned her conclusion about carbon dioxide's impact on climate. One publication even referred to her as Mrs. Elisha Foote and miscredited her work! In comparison, her husband's full paper was published by the *Philosophical Magazine*, one of the oldest publications in England, even though his work was less significant than hers.

In contrast, John Tyndall found a lot more publicity for his research than Eunice Foote did. John Tyndall (1820-1893) was already a prominent physicist when he conducted the experiment that revealed carbon dioxide's heat-absorbing power. Tyndall earned his degree in physics while studying under prominent experimental physicists at the University of Marburg. Tyndall became well-known for his work on magnetism and glaciers and was interested in the molecular structures that absorbed heat. For his experiments he had access to cutting-edge technology that Eunice Newton Foote did not. In 1859 when he found that carbon dioxide absorbs heat more than other gasses, he rushed to announce his findings to the Royal Society, and he published outlines of his preliminary work in several European journals. In 1861, he published the major paper with his results but made no mention of its climate



applications. Though Tyndall came to the same conclusion about carbon dioxide as Foote, he was not motivated by the study of climate.



Portrait of John Tyndall, Irish Scientist. Image courtesy of AIP Emilio Segrè Visual Archives, E. Scott Barr Collection



John Tyndall's experimental apparatus.<sup>1</sup>

3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Retrieved from: Jackson, Ronald. "Eunice Foote, John Tyndall and a Question of Priority." *The Royal Institution* 74, no. 1 (February 13, 2019): 105–18. <u>https://doi.org/10.1098/rsnr.2018.0066</u>.



It is not known whether Tyndall was aware of Foote's work. There is some evidence he did not know about her conclusions. For instance, he seemed to be surprised by his results on carbon dioxide. He had even initially hypothesized that carbon dioxide *wouldn't* absorb as much hear. In addition, when Tyndall wrote letters to other scientists who were doing similar research, he and the other scientists never mentioned Foote's work. These actions make it seem unlikely that he knew of her work and discovery.

However, there is also some evidence that Tyndall would have known about Foote's work. For instance, one of Tyndall's papers was published in the same journal as Foote's. This indicates that he was aware of the publication and probably read it regularly – maybe he even read the issue where Foote's research was published. Additionally, Tyndall was on the editorial board of *Philosophical Journal*, the publication that selected Foote's husband's work and not hers. The *Philosophical Journal* republished papers which had already appeared in the *American Journal of Arts and Sciences*. Considering Foote's husband's paper was originally published on the page after Eunice Foote's in the *American Journal of Science and Arts*, whoever selected his work must have also seen, and skipped over, hers. As an editor of the *Philosophical Journal*, Tyndall would have been involved in the selection process. Perhaps Tyndall missed Foote's paper? Perhaps he saw but didn't read her paper? Or perhaps, like Joseph Henry, who read her work for AAAS, he did not understand her results? For now, there is only speculation.

Another reason Eunice Foote did not become as famous as John Tyndall was the poor state of the scientific community in the United States during her lifetime. In the early to mid-19<sup>th</sup> century, the United States did not have a well-established or globally revered scientific community. Though there had been some internationally regarded scientists in the United States, such as Benjamin Franklin, Europe was still seen as the center of major scientific work. This posed issues for American scientists as it was difficult and uncommon for people to travel across the Atlantic Ocean, and information delivered through the mail moved slowly. To publicize their work across the ocean, American scientists needed connections in Europe, something an amateur, female, scientist like Eunice Foote likely would not have had. Her location and lack of connections would have made it difficult for her to publicize her findings globally.

The United States' international reputation likely impacted the reception of Foote's work, but undoubtedly so did her gender. Most American colleges and universities did not admit women, so she was prevented from receiving a higher level of education. She also lacked the connections with foreign scientific contemporaries and the equipment resources that Tyndall had. She was discouraged from presenting her own work at the AAAS meeting because she was a woman. To add insult to injury, Henry's remarks about her work missed its significance and he was patronizing about her abilities. Tyndall also believed women were less capable scientists than men. Luckily, today we recognize her important contribution to science and give her the credit she deserves.